

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03319 9464

I N T E R N A T I O N A L H U M A N R I G H T S L A W

Readings, Problems, and Clinical Exercises

Edited by

James C. Hathaway
Osgoode Hall Law School

and

David Petrasek

VOLUME

1

Second Edition
1987

1983
1984
1985
1986

95-412 TWO

LAW LIBRARY

JAN 11 1988

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

I N T E R N A T I O N A L H U M A N R I G H T S L A W

Readings, Problems, and Clinical Exercises

Edited by

James C. Hathaway
Osgoode Hall Law School

and

David Petrasek

VOLUME

1

Second Edition
1987

K
3240.3
H 09
1781
v 1

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

These materials are prepared for the exclusive use of students enrolled in the seminar in International Human Rights Law at the Osgoode Hall Law School of York University, Toronto, Canada. They may not be reproduced without the express consent of the editors of this book, or that of the author(s) of non-original text as identified herein.

Acknowledgments

We are pleased to gratefully acknowledge the contributions of the students and staff of the Osgoode Hall Law School to the preparation of these teaching materials.

First, the students enrolled in this seminar in 1985 and 1986 made many helpful suggestions which we have strived to incorporate. We hope to continue to learn from the insights of those who study these materials.

Thanks as well to Norma Eakin of the Law Library, who managed to track down even the most esoteric journals for our review; to Kathy Jetten, for her assistance in typing and proofreading these materials; and to Jan Carter of the Material Distribution Centre for her care in the assembly and production of the book. Sincere appreciation is due to the team of Osgoode students who assisted us in the proofreading of these materials, including Alan Butcher, Alyson Feltes, Cliff Louie, Marcus Pratt, and Michael Wright.

A special acknowledgment is owed to Sydne Conover-Taggart who prepared major revisions to Chapter 10 dealing with the international human rights lawmaking process.

Finally, and most particularly, we are indebted to George Gonsalves who tirelessly devoted himself to the production of these materials. His sincere commitment to quality work was invaluable.

J.C.H.
D.P.

August 1987

TABLE OF CONTENTS

VOLUME ONE

Acknowledgments.....	i
Prologue: The Preamble to the Universal Declaration of Human Rights.....	ii
Course Description.....	1
CHAPTER 1: THE CONCEPTUAL BASIS OF INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW.....	3
Introduction.....	3
Klein, Sovereign Equality Among States, The History of An Idea.....	4
Sieghart, The International Law of Human Rights.....	8 ✓
Humphrey, The International Law of Human Rights in the Middle Twentieth Century.....	13
Kothari, Towards a Just World.....	20
Shestack, The Jurisprudence of Human Rights.....	21
Szabo, Historical Foundations of Human Rights.....	44
Sinha, Human Rights: A Non-Western Viewpoint.....	46
Pahr, Human Rights in a Pluralistic World.....	48
CHAPTER 2: THE LEGAL FOUNDATION OF CONTEMPORARY INTER- NATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW.....	51
Introduction.....	51
Greig, International Law.....	51
Charter of the United Nations.....	53
Lauterpacht, International Law and Human Rights.....	63
Editors' Note.....	69
Schewlb, The International Court of Justice and the Human Rights Clauses of the Charter.....	69
Schachter, The Charter and the Constitution: The Human Rights Provisions in American Law.....	74
Leary, When Does the Implementation of International Human Rights Law Constitute Interference Into the Essentially Domestic Affairs of a State?.....	79
Watson, Autointerpretation, Competence and the Contin- uing Validity of Article 2(7) of the UN Charter..	83
Diagram of the Structure of the United Nations.....	90
Simulation Exercises.....	91

CHAPTER 3: MAJOR SOURCES OF SUBSTANTIVE HUMAN RIGHTS	
NORMS: THE INTERNATIONAL BILL OF RIGHTS.....	94
Introduction.....	94
Assignment.....	95
Saari and Higgins Cass, The United Nations and the International Protection of Human Rights: A Legal Analysis and Interpretation.....	95
THE UNIVERSAL DECLARATION OF HUMAN RIGHTS.....	96
The Universal Declaration of Human Rights.....	96
Szabo, Historical Foundations of Human Rights.....	103
Alston, The Universal Declaration at 35: Western and Passe or Alive and Universal.....	105
THE INTERNATIONAL COVENANTS ON HUMAN RIGHTS.....	118
International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights.....	118
International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.....	130
Saario and Higgins Cass, The United Nations and the International Protection of Human Right.....	154
Lippman, Human Rights Revisited: The Protection of Human Rights Under The International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.....	155
van Boven, Distinguishing Criteria of Human Rights....	161
ADDITIONAL SOURCES OF SUBSTANTIVE HUMAN RIGHTS NORMS..	166
Introduction.....	166
Marie, International Instruments Relating to Human Rights; Classification and Chart Showing Ratifications as of 1 January, 1987.....	167
Simulation Exercises.....	175
CHAPTER 4: THE GENERAL ENFORCEMENT OF HUMAN RIGHTS UNDER THE AUSPICES OF THE CHARTER OF THE UNITED NATIONS.....	178
Introduction.....	178
Assignment.....	179
United Nations, The United Nations and Human Rights...	179
Sohn, Human Rights: Their Implementation and Super- vision by the United Nations.....	183
Tardu, United Nations Response to Gross Violations of Human Rights.....	185
ECOSOC Resolution 728.....	196
ECOSOC Resolution 1235.....	198
ECOSOC Resolution 1503.....	199

Sub-Commission on Prevention of Discrimination and Protection of Minorities, Provisional Procedures for Dealing with the Question of the Admissibility of Communications.....	202
Gonzales, The Political Sources of Procedural Debates in the United Nations: Structural Impediments to Implementation of Human Rights.....	204
Weissbrodt, The Three 'Theme' Special Rapporteurs of the UN Commission on Human Rights.....	208
Sampson, Procedural Law.....	219
Miller, United Nations Fact-Finding Missions in the Field of Human Rights.....	227
Cohn, International Fact-Finding Processes and the Rule of Law.....	232
Simulation Exercise.....	235

CHAPTER 5: THE ENFORCEMENT OF HUMAN RIGHTS BY PERIODIC REPORTING REQUIREMENTS..... 236

Introduction.....	236
Assignment.....	238

THE TREATY APPROACH TO STANDARD-SETTING..... 238

McKean, Equality and Discrimination under Interna- tional Law.....	238
International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination.....	239
McKean, Equality and Discrimination under Inter- national Law.....	254
Das, United Nations Institutions and Procedures Founded on Conventions on Human Rights and Fundamental Freedoms.....	260
Meron, Human Rights - Effective Remedies.....	268
Reisman, Responses to Crimes of Discrimination and Genocide: An Appraisal of the Convention on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination.....	270
Gomez del Prado, United Nations Conventions on Human Rights: The Practices of the Human Rights Com- mitttee and the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination in Dealing with Reporting Obligations of States Parties.....	272
Bilder, Rethinking International Human Rights: Some Basic Questions.....	272

THE MODEL RULE APPROACH TO STANDARD-SETTING..... 274

Lillich and Newman, International Human Rights: Problems of Law and Policy.....	274
Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners.	276
Skoler, World Implementation of the United Nations Standard Minimum Rules for the Treatment of Prisoners.....	288

Toman, Quasi-Legal Standards and Guidelines for Protecting Human Rights of Detained Persons.....	300
Editors' Note: Other Examples of the Model Rule Approach at the United Nations.....	301
Simulation Exercise.....	301

CHAPTER 6: THE ENFORCEMENT OF HUMAN RIGHTS BY INTERSTATE AND INDIVIDUAL COMPLAINT MECHANISMS..... 304

Introduction.....	304
Assignment.....	305

A. INTERSTATE COMPLAINT PROCEDURES.....	305
Introduction.....	305

International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights..	306
Editors' Note.....	309

International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination.....	310
--	-----

Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.....	312
---	-----

Editors' Note re Interstate Complaints.....	314
---	-----

Regional Interstate Complaint Mechanisms: The European System.....	315
--	-----

Editors' Note re Regionally Established Interstate Complaint Mechanisms.....	315
--	-----

Mikaelson, European Protection of Human Rights.....	315
---	-----

Becket, The Greek Case Before the European Human Rights Commission.....	318
---	-----

Council of Europe, Chart: Inter-State Applications...	331
---	-----

B. INDIVIDUAL PETITION PROCEDURES UNDER THE UNITED NATIONS AND REGIONAL ORGANIZATIONS.....	332
--	-----

International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights..	332
--	-----

Prounis, The Human Rights Committee: Toward Resolving the Paradox of Human Rights Law.....	332
--	-----

Optional Protocol to the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights.....	246
--	-----

Editors' Note re the Optional Protocol.....	350
---	-----

Sandra Lovelace v. Canada (1979).....	350
---------------------------------------	-----

Sandra Lovelace v. Canada (1981).....	352
---------------------------------------	-----

Capotorti, The International Measures of Implementation Included in the Covenants on Human Rights...	363
--	-----

Bilder, Rethinking Human Rights: Some Basic Questions	364
---	-----

Other United Nations Multilateral Treaties.....	365
Introduction.....	365
Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination.....	365
Editors' Note re Racial Discrimination Convention.....	367
Convention Against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or Degrading Treatment or Punishment.....	367
Editors' Note re Torture Convention.....	368
UNESCO Procedures.....	368
Alston, UNESCO's Procedure for Dealing with Human Rights Violations.....	368
International Labor Organization Procedures.....	376
Landy, The Implementation Procedures of the Interna- tional Labor Organization.....	376
Procedures Under the European Convention on Human Rights.....	383
Introduction.....	383
Encyclopedia of Public International Law, European Convention on Human Rights.....	384
Simulation Exercise.....	384

VOLUME TWO

CHAPTER 7: ECONOMIC SANCTIONS AS A MEANS OF ENFORCING INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW.....	390
Introduction.....	390
Assignment.....	392
Macdonald, Economic Sanctions in the International System.....	392
Doxey, International Sanctions in Theory and Practice.	406
Maddrey, Economic Sanctions Against South Africa: Problems and Prospects for Enforcement of Human Rights Norms.....	410
Davids, The Impact of Economic Sanctions Against South Africa on the SADCC States.....	422
Eminent Persons Group, Mission to South Africa.....	433
Simulation Exercise: The Commonwealth Accord.....	439

CHAPTER 8: THE USE OF ARMED FORCE TO ENFORCE INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS.....	443
Introduction.....	443
Behuniak, The Law of Unilateral Humanitarian Intervention by Armed Force: A Legal Survey.....	444
Fairley, State Actors, Humanitarian Intervention and International Law: Reopening Pandora's Box.....	458
Neuhold, Threat to Peace.....	466
Delbruck, Collective Security.....	469
Editors' Note and Diagram re Security Council Enforcement Actions.....	471
Reisman, Criteria for the Lawful Use of Force in International Law.....	472
Levitin, The Law of Force and the Force of Law: Grenada, The Falklands and Humanitarian Intervention.....	475
Brownlie, Humanitarian Intervention.....	479
Simulation Exercise.....	484
CHAPTER 9: ECONOMIC, SOCIAL, AND CULTURAL RIGHTS AS HUMAN RIGHTS.....	487
Introduction.....	487
Cranston, What are Human Rights?.....	488
Donnelly, The Concept of Human Rights.....	493
Editors' Note.....	499
International Commission of Jurists, The Limburg Principles.....	500
Haile, Human Rights in Africa: Observations on the Implication of Economic Priority.....	503
Trubek, Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights in the Third World: Human Rights Law and Human Needs Programs.....	511
CHAPTER 10: THE INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAWMAKING PROCESS: THE RIGHT TO FOOD.....	538
Introduction.....	538
Context of the Simulation Exercise.....	538
Documentation to be Prepared.....	539
Preparation for the Simulation Exercise.....	540
First Meeting of the Commission.....	541
Alston, International Law and the Human Right to Food.	541
Spitz, Right to Food for Peoples and for the Peoples: a Historical Perspective.....	542
Conover Taggart, Evaluating the International Right to Food.....	543

George, How the Other Half Dies.....	543
Christensen and Hanrahan, African Food Crises: Short-, Medium-, and Long-Term Responses.....	553
Williams, The Nature of the World Food and Population Problem.....	555
Alston, International Law and the Human Right to Food.	563
Universal Declaration of Human Rights.....	592
International Covenant on Economic, Social, and Cultural Rights.....	592
Universal Declaration on the Eradication of Hunger and Malnutrition.....	593
General Assembly Resolution 38/158 (1983).....	599
Westerveen, Toward a System for Supervising States' Compliance with the Right to Food.....	605
Food and Agricultural Organization, Food Aid and Food Security: Past Performance and Future Potential.	610
Jackson, Food Aid: Contribution or Obstacle?.....	616
Tangley, Beyond the Green Revolution.....	621
Alston and Eide, Advancing the Right to Food in International Law.....	625
Alston, International Law and the Human Right to Food.	633
Williams, The Nature of the World Food and Population Problem.....	634
Christensen, The Right to Food: How to Guarantee.....	642
Collins, The Right to Food and the New International Economic Order.....	647
Westerveen, Towards a System for Supervising States' Compliance with the Right to Food.....	657
Bergesen, A New Food Regime: Necessary but Impossible	663
Alston, International Law and the Human Right to Food.	669
Background for the Simulation: Mandate and Progress Report of the Special Rapporteur on the Right to Food.....	672
Sub-Commission, Resolution 1982/7.....	672
Commission on Human Rights, Resolution 1983/16.....	673
Economic and Social Council, Resolution 1983/140.....	675
Sub-Commission, Progress Report by the Special Rap- porteur on the Right to Food (1984).....	675

CHAPTER 11: EMERGING HUMAN RIGHTS..... 699

Introduction.....	699
Marks, Emerging Human Rights: A New Generation for the 1980s.....	700
de Vey Mestdagh, The Right to Development: From Evolving Principle to 'Legal' Right: In Search of its Substance.....	713
Bedjaoui, Towards a New International Economic Order..	720
Alston, Conjuring Up New Human Rights: A Proposal for Quality Control.....	727

CHAPTER 12: A RECONSIDERATION OF THE ROLE OF LAW IN THE INTERNATIONAL PROTECTION OF HUMAN RIGHTS.....	738
Introduction.....	738
Watson, Legal Theory, Efficacy and Validity in the Development of Human Rights Norms in Interna- tional Law.....	739
Forsythe, Human Rights and World Politics.....	748
Joyce, The New Politics of Human Rights.....	749
Lane, Human Rights Within the World Legal Order.....	752

INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

Professor James Hathaway
Osgoode Hall Law School

1987

Course Description

Enrolment: This seminar is open to 20 students drawn from the second and third year classes.

Format: This seminar is divided into fourteen sessions of three hours each offered on Wednesdays from 3:00 - 6:00 p.m. during the fall semester of the academic year.

Credits: Four.

Course Materials: The required readings and assignments are contained in J. Hathaway and D. Petrasek, International Human Rights Law: Readings, Problems, and Clinical Exercises (1987) (available from the Material Distribution Centre).

Appointments: Appointments may be scheduled with my secretary, Mr. George Gonsalves (outside room 428). My office is Room 425, telephone 736-5049. Please feel free to contact me as you feel may be beneficial.

Evaluation: The seminar grade is comprised of three parts:

- Periodic Essays: An essay assignment will be made for each of seminars 3-7 inclusive (a total of 5 assignments). Students are to prepare a critical analysis which responds directly to the question posed, and which represents the student's independent analytical assessment of the issues raised by the question. No reading other than the required weekly assignments will be necessary in order to prepare the essays. Essays must be typewritten, and should not exceed a length of three double-spaced pages. The essays are due at the beginning of the class for which they are assigned, and will not generally be accepted after that time. While a total of five assignments will be made, students need submit only four essays (although all five essays may be submitted in the student's sole discretion). The average grade of the student's four best essays will comprise 50% of the seminar grade.

- Research Memorandum: Three meetings of the seminar (weeks 10, 11, and 12) will involve students in the simulation of the international human rights lawmaking process. Each student will, to ensure readiness for these negotiations, prepare a research memorandum of approximately 10 double-spaced typed pages

in length which outlines the position of an assigned state or organization on the issue under debate. The memorandum is to be submitted not later than November 2nd. The evaluation of the research memorandum will comprise 25% of the seminar grade.

- Seminar Participation: Because the clinical methodology will be the primary teaching tool for the seminar, students are expected to attend and actively participate in all classes. Frequent use will be made of simulations, role-playing and other forms of active student participation. Some simulation work will occur outside of seminar hours, especially during the consideration of the international human rights lawmaking process (November 4 to 18 inclusive). In recognition of the additional preparation that this approach requires of students, an evaluation will be made of (a) the student's preparedness and willingness to contribute to seminar activities and discussions, and (b) the quality of those interventions. This cumulative evaluation of participation will comprise 25% of the seminar grade.

